

**VILLAGE OF LAKE BLUFF
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
SEPTEMBER 9, 2015**

APPROVED MINUTES

1. Call to Order and Roll Call

A Regular Meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) of the Village of Lake Bluff was called to order on September 9, 2015 at 7:03 p.m. in the Village Hall Board Room.

The following members were present:

Present: Paul Bergmann
 Robert Hunter
 Janie Jerch
 Randolph Liebelt
 Janet Nelson, Chair

Absent: Mary Francoeur
 Cheri Richardson

Also Present: Brandon Stanick, Asst. to the Village Administrator (A to VA)

2. Consideration of the Minutes from the July 8, 2015 HPC Meetings

Member Bergmann moved to approve the August 12, 2015 Meeting Minutes with corrections to several typographical errors. Member Jerch seconded the motion. The motion passed on a unanimous voice vote.

3. Non-Agenda Items and Visitors

Chair Nelson noted there was no one present for this item.

4. Continued Consideration of a Significant Demolition Application for the Complete Demolition of 306 E. Witchwood Lane

Chair Nelson introduced the item and advised the three options before the HPC, including: taking no action; extending the delay 90 days; or extending the delay 120 days. Chair Nelson thanked Mr. Richard Goshgarian, a representative of the Estate of Mary Ann Lea, for allowing the HPC the opportunity to tour the house last week.

Mr. Goshgarian shared his responses to the questions the HPC presented last month and noted the reason for demolition, the plans for the property and the any relevant historic documentation were answered at the previous meeting in August. Providing his answers to the remaining questions, Mr. Goshgarian expressed his belief the structure would not qualify for landmark status because no actions were taken to landmark the house following the 2003 architectural survey. In his response to identifying the costs to rehabilitate the structure compared to demolishing the structure, Mr. Goshgarian noted it would be between \$15,000 and \$20,000 to demolish the house and the sky is the limit as far as building a new home. Additionally, he noted moving the house is not a viable option.

Mr. Goshgarian advised he will not provide a statement of how best to preserve the Village's character as there are other people more qualified than he to provide that opinion.

Chair Nelson thanked him for his comments. Additionally, she provided a brief history of the former owners and advised the house was designed by Ian Lea who worked under Mies van der Rohe. The house has not been altered since it was built. Mr. Lea had originally designed and built the house for his mother. Following his mother's passing, he and his wife, Mary Ann Lea, lived in the house. The house is now under the ownership of Mr. Lea's brother, Malcolm Lea. She noted the house is rated "significant" per the 2003 architectural survey. Chair Nelson noted the HPC has the option to pursue landmark designation, but prefers home owners pursue landmark designation on their own. She stated that landmark designation in Lake Bluff does not prevent the owner from demolishing the house; landmark status only triggers an advisory review process with the HPC.

Member Hunter advised he toured the house with Mr. Goshgarian and Ms. Rockwell (Executor of the Estate) and noted he found it most interesting because it was original to its design and not altered. He expressed his opinion that the house is in good shape, but needs attention with new windows, new doors and a roof.

Member Bergmann stated the house was built in the time of the International style and there are only a few in Lake Bluff designed in this style. Member Bergmann expressed concern for the house not being listed on the Multiple Listing Service (MLS) and having a chance of being sold to someone with the intent to renovate.

Mr. Goshgarian advised that the house has been cleaned up enough to be able to walk through it and show to potential clients. He explained his original direction from his client was to find someone that wants to restore the house; this has been the focus to date. There is no desire from the current owner to demolish the house as soon as the delay is over.

Member Jerch noted she was not available to tour the house last week, but remains interested if a day and time can be arranged.

Member Liebelt stated it would be interesting for someone to purchase the house and restore it, but expressed his understanding the value of the property is the most attractive part of this house.

Member Bergmann stated the Lake Bluff History Museum awarded this home last year with a Most Distinguished Home Award.

Member Jerch inquired of the reason it was recognized by the Museum.

Member Bergmann noted the Museum follows the Secretary of the Interior Standards to award homes and further noted the house has not been altered from its original design, which is a criterion of the Standards.

A discussion ensued regarding the HPC's interest in pursuing landmark designation for the house.

Member Jerch expressed her support for extending the delay to allow more time for the submission of landmark nomination application.

Mr. Goshgarian stated that his client, Mr. Malcolm Lea, has communicated that the Leas were not supportive of landmark designation when approached in the past. Mr. Goshgarian shared his belief that pursuing landmark designation is punitive and would just further delay the demolition.

Chair Nelson stated the HPC would like to document the house before it's demolished and the landmark designation provides for that opportunity.

Member Hunter expressed his support for the HPC to submit a landmark nomination application and not delay any further.

Mr. Goshgarian advised he will ask Malcolm Lea for permission to make the architectural drawings available to the Commission to make copies.

As no further discussion came before the Commission, Member Bergmann moved the HPC serve as the applicant and submit a landmark nomination application for 306 E. Witchwood Lane in time for the October 14, 2015 HPC meeting. Member Jerch seconded the motion. The motion passed on the following roll call vote:

Ayes: (5) Bergmann, Hunter, Jerch, Liebelt and Chair Nelson
Nays: (0)
Absent: (2) Francoeur and Richardson

A to VA Stanick advised the HPC will need to submit the application by September 21, 2015 to meet the notice publication deadline.

5. Consideration of a Significant Demolition Application for the Complete Demolition of 142 E. Woodland Road

Chair Nelson introduced the item and advised the three options before the HPC, including: taking no action; extending the delay 90 days; or extending the delay 120 days.

Mr. John Sorenson, a representative of U.S. Shelter, shared his responses to the questions posed by the HPC and noted the house is proposed for demolition so a new home can be built and meet the needs of a young family with children. If the existing home were to be remodeled to add space it would change the character of the house completely. Mr. Sorenson stated it is the plan to build a home that fits within the community meeting the needs of today's home owners and adds value to the Lake Bluff community. Further, in response to the request to provide any historical information that may be available, Mr. Sorenson noted he was unable to locate any historic significance about the property. He noted the home was built by the Harlan Family and understand it may have had a car port, which has since been converted to a garage; no records were found in the Lake Bluff History Museum. Mr. Sorenson expressed his belief the home does not qualify for landmark status because it was not the only ranch built by the Harlan Family and is not the only remaining ranch style home in the Village. He noted a potential remodel versus new construction analysis supports new construction. Mr. Sorenson also stated the house is not capable of being moved. In response to

the question how best to preserve the Village's character, Mr. Sorenson noted the house will be smaller than what the Zoning Code allows and the new construction seeks to best preserve as many trees as possible which will help to preserve some of the old established feeling of the neighborhood.

Further, Mr. Sorenson noted the house was built in 1927 with a partial basement and approximately 1,500 sq. ft. above grade. The house is an existing legal non conformity with regards to its westerly setback. Mr. Sorenson noted he will do his best to preserve the oak tree in the rear yard.

Member Bergmann shared an earlier picture of the house with the HPC.

Ms. Leslie Bishop (resident) advised she lives near the subject property and expressed her concern with the flooding that occurs in her particular area of the neighborhood. She inquired if the new house will be larger than the existing house and increase in lot coverage, which would affect the stormwater drainage in the area.

Mr. Sorenson advised the new house will be larger and that stormwater drainage must be addressed per the Lake County stormwater management requirements.

Mr. Norman Blier (resident) stated he is a neighbor of the subject property and advised the flooding in the area can be severe at times and has the potential to flood his basement.

Following a discussion regarding stormwater requirements, Chair Nelson thanked Ms. Bishop and Mr. Blier for attending the meeting and sharing their comments as they are important to know regarding new construction.

Mr. Blier expressed his concern for potentially losing the oak trees on the subject property because of construction.

Member Bergmann expressed his concern for the new house proposed for the subject property and expressed his opinion it doesn't fit the character of the neighborhood.

As no further discussion came before the HPC, Member Hunter moved to terminate the demolition review of 142 E. Woodland Rd. Member Jerch seconded the motion. The motion passed on the following roll call vote:

Ayes: (5) Bergmann, Hunter, Jerch, Liebelt and Chair Nelson
Nays: (0)
Absent: (2) Francoeur and Richardson

6. A Continued Discussion Regarding the History of Neighborhoods in Lake Bluff

Chair Nelson distributed an updated copy of a map of Lake Bluff identifying several areas in the Village for discussion purposes regarding the history of Lake Bluff neighborhoods. She presented the following areas for discussion:

- Camp Meeting Grounds (identify Children's Home),
- Summer Resort Area,

- Rockland Area,
- Dwyer Settlement,
- Tangley Oaks,
- Lake Bluff Terrace Area,
- Stonebridge,
- Ravine Forest Area, and
- Estate Areas (total of five estates).

A discussion followed regarding the history of each area.

It was the consensus of the HPC to identify two additional areas: Crab Tree Farm and Shore Acres.

Member Jerch suggested a timeline be developed to guide the research of these areas.

7. Chairperson's Report

Chair Nelson had no report.

8. Staff Report

A to VA Stanick confirmed the next HPC meeting is scheduled for October 14, 2015. In addition, he noted the demolition of the Blair House is still being pursued; however, the owner must submit a demolition plan that identifies an alternate access route before the permit is issued.

9. Adjournment

As there was no further business to come before the Commission, Member Bergmann moved to adjourn the meeting. Member Jerch seconded the motion. The motion passed on a unanimous voice vote and the meeting adjourned at 8:42 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Brandon Stanick
Asst. to the Village Administrator